

MINUTES FOR THE VILLAGE OF SHOREWOOD HILLS PLAN COMMISSION

The Tuesday, March 12, 2019 meeting of the Plan Commission was called to order at 7:02 pm by Chair Dave Benforado. Members present were: Mr. Benforado, Deb Remington, Jim Etmanczyk, Karl Wellensiek, Earl Munson, Brauna Hartzell and John Imes. Also present was Karl Frantz, Village Administrator and David Sykes, Administrative Services Manager/Deputy Clerk. Six visitors were in the audience.

Mr. Frantz confirmed the meeting had been properly posted and noticed.

Public Hearing on special height exception permit at property described as Lot 1 Beloit Court replat, Lot 18, Block 19 First Addition to College Hills

Mr. Benforado opened the public hearing at 7:05 pm.

Property owner Tim Ridders introduced the reason for the special exception permit. He purchased the property at 2900 Hunter Hill and subsequently split the lot below it. He would like to build a house into the landscape trying to be sensitive to the topography of the lot.

Mr. Ridders architect David Black described the design and difficulties of the lot. There is a 40 foot elevation change on the lot. He designed a flat roof to fit the house in below the 22' height limitation. It would be built into the hill, much of the house below grade. They are looking for some relief to the height limit for the extreme edges of the house. Mr. Black provided a site survey, design plan and 3-D model of the lot.

Mr. Munson asked about erosion control. Mr. Black indicated they would have to deal with erosion control. Mr. Munson also asked if the home would be owner-occupied. Mr. Ridders said he intends to live in the new home and sell 2900 Hunter Hill.

Mr. Benforado reminded Commission members that erosion control plans, stormwater management plans, driveway location, stormwater easement on a portion of the natural kettle, landscape plan, construction parking plan, lighting plan, building permits will all have to be reviewed and approved by staff.

Mr. Benforado asked if Mr. Ridders had talked to his neighbors about building the new home. Mr. Ridders indicated he had shown the plans to his neighbor to the south and has so far received no negative comments.

Mr. Etmanczyk was concerned about the driveway exiting on Harvard Drive because it has a lot of bike and pedestrian traffic. Mr. Ridders and Mr. Black talked about keeping the slope manageable, which would not allow the driveway to exit onto Beloit Court.

Kathy Killian, 2910 Harvard Drive, owner of the property to the west was concerned about the size of the house. 2,800 square foot home on an odd shaped lot. She also reminded the Commission of the original private covenants that limited building on this lot because of how it could affect future drainage. She acknowledged the Village may have no legal standing to enforce the covenants but the Commission could abide by the original homeowners intent.

Cheri Carbon, 2714 Harvard Drive, is concerned about the proposed driveway that would exit onto the one-way section of Harvard Drive where there are no other driveways. She feels it would be unsafe for the numerous pedestrians that travel that section to school or the University. She is also concerned about flooding on Beloit Court to University Bay Drive if a new home is built on this lot. She mentioned the lot does not actually touch Beloit Court, there is Village owned parkland between Beloit Court and this lot.

Leslie Thompson, 1008 Beloit Court, said she was disappointed that the wooded lot would be developed. When she bought her home, she was under the impression that this lot was unbuildable. She is also concerned about stormwater runoff and the wildlife in the area.

Mr. Ridders indicated he is aware of the neighbor's concerns and attempted to design the home to minimize the impact on the slope.

Mr. Benforado mentioned that Karla Knobel, 1006 University Bay Drive, submitted a letter to Commission members detailing her concerns.

The public hearing was closed at 7:48 pm.

Consider recommendation and findings on special height exception permit at property described as Lot 1 Beloit Court replat, Lot 18, Block 19 First Addition to College Hills

Mr. Munson was very concerned about stormwater and runoff. He feels the special exception ordinance is ripe for litigation. He feels the Commission is failing its responsibility by delegating approvals to on these items to Village staff.

Mr. Frantz indicated staff approvals are based on the Village's Stormwater Management and Erosion Control ordinances, so they are not approved subjectively. Property owners must comply and demonstrate their plans with control features. The Village engineer reviews the plans for approval.

Ms. Remington asked if it would be possible to have erosion control plans done before approval of the special height exception. Ms. Hartzell agreed adding that the process may be in the wrong order. Mr. Black said the height sets the driveway location and other landscape levels, it would be very difficult to design erosion control plans without the height set.

Mr. Benforado felt it could be a hardship to the applicant to go through the stormwater/erosion control process before the project is approved/denied.

Ms. Remington felt it is not a hardship since the property owner indicated he had the option to build the home deeper into the hill (at a greater expense) which would be below the height limit.

Mr. Ridders offered to postpone the special exception process until more information could be provided to the Commission.

The Commission discussed what information they required to make a decision.

Mr. Munson moved and Mr. Wellensiek seconded a motion to postpone the process until the applicant provided an Erosion Control Plan, Stormwater Management Plan, Landscaping Plan and driveway cut design that satisfy the Village ordinances.

Vote: 6-1 (Mr. Benforado voting no).

Public Hearing on special floor area exception permit for property located at 3407 Circle Close

Mr. Benforado opened the public hearing at 8:35 pm.

Property owner Kelly Tormaschy introduced the project. The property was the former home and office of architect William Kaeser. The reason for the floor area exception is the addition of a partial second floor addition. The home is sprawling over a large area with a number of nonconventional angles. Having different levels to the home provides some architectural interest. A useful second floor requires some square footage for two small bedrooms, closets and stairs. The proposed design is similar to other homes in the cul du sac. The home is on a large lot and has significant setbacks from the lot lines.

Mr. Tormaschy added that the home was on the market for two years and the only other interest was from someone who would tear it down and rebuild a larger home.

Mr. Imes asked if he had talked to his neighbors about the proposed plan. Mr. Tormaschy said he talked with some neighbors prior to purchasing the home. He also had a holiday gathering where ~16 of his neighbors had the opportunity to review his plans. Some were please the home was not going to be torn down and he is not aware of any objections to the plans.

The public hearing was closed at 8:56 pm.

Consider recommendation and findings on special floor area exception permit for property located at 3407 Circle Close

Mr. Benforado reviewed the proposed findings to the special floor area exception permit application.

Ms. Remington asked if the second story would affect the light of the neighbors. The setbacks allow for 40' between homes, so there will be no effect on the neighbors.

Mr. Benforado reminded the applicant that, if approved, he would need to comply with the noise, construction, lighting, and any other ordinances and provide a construction parking plan.

Mr. Munson moved and Mr. Wellensiek seconded a motion to recommend approval of the special floor area exception permit to the Board of Trustees.

Vote: 7-0.

Good neighbor policy progress and recommendation on continuance

The policy for certain building permit applicant to notify neighbors in writing and have a meeting to inform them of the building project was a trial policy with a one-year sunset.

Mr. Frantz indicated that the policy has been successful by getting neighbors to interact prior to problems occurring, but not a lot of people have attended the scheduled meetings.

Mr. Munson moved and Ms. Remington seconded a motion to recommend extending this policy permanently.

Vote: 7-0.

Approve previous meeting minutes

Mr. Wellensiek moved and Ms. Hartzell seconded a motion to approve the January 15, 2019 meeting minutes.

Vote: 7-0.

Future Meeting

March 26, 2019 at 7:00 pm: Vandewalle will be presenting their recommendations from the Garden Homes Planning Process.

Ms. Hartzell asked if there was going to be any report on stormwater concerns related to Vandewalle's presentation.

Mr. Benforado reviewed the status of the Stormwater Committee's work to date. The Committee plans to have an interim report ready for the Board by May 1. They are having discussions with City of Madison staff about proposed solutions to the stormwater problem. The Committee is likely to recommend the Village join the City as a client of their stormwater consultant, AE2S.

Adjourn

The meeting was adjourned at 9:35 pm.

Respectfully submitted,

David Sykes
Administrative Services Manager/Deputy Clerk