

# MINUTES FOR THE VILLAGE OF SHOREWOOD HILLS PLAN COMMISSION

*(Final approved minutes)*

**Date and Time:** Tuesday, May 8, 2007 – 7:00 pm

**Location:** Village Hall – 810 Shorewood Boulevard

The meeting was called order by Chair Mark Sundquist at 7:00 pm. Compliance with the open meeting law was noted. Members present were Mark Sundquist, Dave Benforado, James Etmanczyk, Jill Dittrich, William Thomas, Lea Aschkenase and Karl Wellensiek. Also present was Village Administrator Karl Frantz.

**Review and possible action on sign permit application for ATT and Allstate facade signs at ATT Plaza** – Karl Frantz reviewed the application. The request is to place a new facade sign on the building with ATT and the ATT logo using ATT colors of blue and black. The Cingular sign will be removed from its current location. It also requests replacement of the Allstate sign with blue lettering. There was considerable discussion about the signage requirements at this Plaza. Mr. Frantz provided the Commission with a copy of the planned unit development agreement for the shopping center and also referred to the sign code.

Mr. Etmanczyk seconded by Ms. Aschkenase move to approve the sign permit application as submitted contingent upon the Village Administrator verifying that all provisions of the sign code related to the size of the sign conformed to Village code. The motion was approved unanimously.

**Public Hearing on conditional use and special exception permit applications for a residential construction project at 3534 Lake Mendota Drive** - Mr. Sundquist called the public hearing to order. Representatives of the Comers provided a presentation of the project. Mr. Ron Trachtenberg, attorney representing Shadrock LLC (the Comer's) spoke. Mr. Trachtenberg indicated that they were applying for a special exception and conditional use permit. They were looking to exceed the floor area limit of approximately 4,800 s.f. and build a home of roughly 8,688 s.f. Mr. Trachtenberg pointed out if four homes were built on the four lots involved, that each house could be about 3,200 s.f. which would allow for about 14,000 s.f. total on these lots. Mr. Trachtenberg introduced the individuals (consultants) who would be presenting the project. He said the project does not set any kind of precedent as it is the only parcel in the Village comprised of four lots with one house on the lots, a very unique parcel in the Village. He also said that they had an appraisal done on the property and the rational economic decision if this project is not allowed to move forward is to sell the four lots separately.

Mr. Comer introduced himself. He said has talked with the neighbors and was forthright with them. They have lowered the roof from 30 feet to 29 feet based on neighbor concerns. They are fond of Shorewood Hills and wish to live here. He has lived in the Madison area for a long time while his wife hails from Chicago. Mr. Comer stated that he has found this commission to be technically minded and he therefore has brought experts who have been working on things such

as stormwater runoff, tree preservation and energy conservation to talk about the project and what is planned. He stated his father had looked at this lot nearly thirty years ago for purchase.

Stuart Cohen of Stuart Cohen/Hacker architects introduced himself and his firm. He stated that this is the best residential site they had ever worked on and among the best clients. He stated the attendant concerns of green building, energy conservation, the environment and design were unmatched. He stated that they had managed to only impact four trees on a site with 73 trees. It is a traditional, shingled house in keeping with the neighborhood and use of natural materials. The ridge has been lowered. The house has not been made smaller from what was proposed at the previous meeting. It is their dream house. The house is ten feet further from the ravine to the east. It is only twenty feet longer than the existing house, although it is twice the size of the former house. Bruce Allison of Allison Tree Services then spoke about the trees on the site and the inventory he did, as well as the tree protection plan he will do. If four homes are built on the site at least 1/3 of the trees would be lost. Scott Travis then discussed the landscape plan. Ron Kloss, Civil Engineer then spoke about water and runoff issues. They have prepared a detailed erosion control and stormwater management plan. This includes rain gardens and infiltration trenches. Mr. Kloss stated that they would be required to obtain permits from Dane County. Plan Commissioner Thomas stated that he had talked to Jeremy Balousek at the County and that in his opinion the County has no jurisdiction, and that the developers had incorrectly said they would be regulated by the County and the Village had nothing to worry about.

Sam Miller, Mechanical Engineer then reviewed the potential energy efficiency plans for the house including that geo thermal was not viable according to their research.

Tom Young, 2801 Colgate presented charts showing size of homes and lots in the Village. He stated that that this house was far too large in comparison. It should be at the largest, 6,000 – 6,500 square feet. He hoped there would be some compromise.

Tom Brock, 1227 Dartmouth Road mentioned concern for the park next door and impacts on it. He is also concerned about noise that might emanate from this large a structure. He cannot conceive why someone needs a house this large, except for big parties and then parking would be an issue.

Karen Rebholz, 3535 Lake Mendota Drive. They live directly south. She submitted a memo to the Plan Commission. The house is too big. This will set a bad precedent for the new zoning regulations. They will also suffer a loss of lake view. She also said their (Comer's) diagram comparing the homes and view impacts is misleading. She showed views from their home and how it would be impacted. She disputed the roof height and said it is higher than what is allowed.

Mike von Schneidemesser, 3555 Tally Ho Lane. Why is it necessary to tear down such a beautiful home? The proposed home is too large.

Al McCoy, 3545 Lake Mendota Drive. His family lives immediately opposite this structure. He is concerned that the new structure could reduce the value of their home by \$200,000.00 due to height. They will lose view of lake. Compromise is possible. Perhaps one allow for the volume

in exchange for a reduction in height. He believes splitting the lot into four and building four homes would be acceptable.

Tracy Walder, 3626 Lake Mendota Drive. Why not renovate what is on site? It is too large. It is out of character. It looks like a condo. Treat the property with respect.

Bob Hastings, 3549 Lake Mendota Drive. They live to the east. They would prefer this proposed house then four homes. He wishes it were smaller, but it is acceptable.

Earl Munson, 3610 Lake Mendota Drive. Lives two houses down. Hopes they (the Comer's) will live in the Village, but they need to compromise. Seems that they hope that all the environmental efforts they make will allow them to build so large. That does not seem to be the reason the ordinance is in place, but if so, the Plan Commission needs to articulate that.

Christopher Wilcox, 3668 Lake Mendota Drive. There are enormous concerns from lots of people. This is a dramatic example of why the ordinance was put in place. Residents need the Plan Commission's protection as does the ordinance.

Mark Sundquist then closed the Public Hearing.

**Possible actions and recommendations on special exception and conditional use permit request for a construction project located at 3534 Lake Mendota Drive** – The Plan Commission did not take action on the permit application. Various commissioners noted concerns regarding the square footage of the home and the degree to which it exceeds the floor area requirements. The Commission felt that some revisions may be able to be made to make the project more in keeping with the floor area requirements, and deferred action to give the applicants the ability to consider changes.

**Update on possible redevelopments in the Marshall Court and Pyare Square areas** – A brief update on these two possible redevelopment projects was given.

The meeting was then adjourned.

Respectfully submitted,  
Karl Frantz  
Village Administrator